Critical Success Factors for Public-Private Partnership “PPP’s”
Infrastructure Projects in Jordan

Prepared by
Fatima Rakan Ahmed Al-Allaff
Supervisor
Associate Prof. Dr. Ibrahim A. Mohammed

This Thesis is submitted in Partial Fulfillment of the
Requirements for The Master's Degree in Engineering Project
Management
Faculty of Engineering
Isra University

Amman-Jordan
August - 2018
AUTHORIZATION FORM

I, Fatima Rakan Ahmed Al-Allaff, authorize Isra University to supply copies of my thesis to libraries or establishments or individuals on request, in accordance to the university regulations.

Signature

Date

14-08-2018
COMMITTEE DECISION

This thesis (Critical Success Factors for Public-Private Partnership "PPP’s"
Infrastructure Projects in Jordan was successfully defended and approved on (14-8-
2018)

Examination Committee

Associate Prof. Dr. Ibrahim A. Mohammed (Supervisor)
Al Isra University
Assistant Dr. Mohammed Salman Al-Lami (Member)
Al Isra University
Associate Prof. Yousef Al-Abdallat (Member)
University of Jordan

Signature

Isra University
Amman-Jordan
DEDICATION

I would like to dedicate this research study to my parents “Eng. Rakan Al-Allaff and Eng. Taghreed Al-Saigh”, whom supported me continuously and taught me the value of education, whom encouraged me through my educating years with their endless love, prayers and continuous sacrifices.

I also would like to thank my fiancé “Bilal Al Qaisi” for his endless love and believe in me.

I am also grateful for the presence of my beautiful siblings “Farah, Falah and Mohammed Al Fatih”.

I pray that Allah, the most gracious, the most merciful to grant them paradise as a reward for their patience and efforts.

This thesis is dedicated to all of you with much love and appreciation.
ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

One Who Does Not Thank People Does Not Thank Allah

Firstly, I give my gratitude to Allah (S.W.T) whom has granted me the privilege of being able to conduct this study and easing the process of this journey, in which a lifetime of thankfulness will not measure.

I wish to extend my appreciation to Associate Professor Dr. Ibrahim A. Mohammed whom was my advisor for this thesis study, Dr. Ibrahim provided me with guidance and support to complete this study.

In addition, I would like to thank my amazing friend and work colleague “Eng. Obayda Hammash” for her encouragement and understanding through my whole journey.

I humbly extend my gratitude to everyone who was concerned about my study, my colleagues and friends who have supported me with love and appreciation.

Finally, I would like to give my ultimate appreciation to my lovely family “My Parent, my brothers, My Sister and My lovely fiancé Bilal Al Qaisi” where I wouldn’t be here if it weren’t for them. Thank you for believing in me and allowing me to believe in myself.
Critical Success Factors for Public-Private Partnership “PPPs” Infrastructure

Projects in Jordan

Critical Success Factors for Public-Private Partnership “PPPs” Infrastructure

Projects in Jordan

By:

Fatima Rakan Ahmed Al-Allaff

Supervisor:

Associate Prof. Dr. Ibrahim A. Mohammed

ABSTRACT

The Hashemite Kingdom of Jordan is considered to be a developing country who faced rapid economic growth over the past five years due to sudden immigration of Syrian Refugees. Whereas 1.4 million Syrian refugees immigrated to Jordan, only 20 percent are located in refugee camps. Desperate need of proper infrastructure is requested to assure better sustainable development, yet these projects cannot be funded by the government alone due to very high cost. As for the coming 10 years, the Jordanian government is set to invest 6.9 billion JDS in water and energy projects while millions will be invested in transportation, and Municipalities’ infrastructure projects. Therefore, Public–private partnerships (PPPs) has become essential. Although these projects have been successfully implemented in other developing countries yet PPPs are not yet widely used in Jordan’s public facilities and services, the reasons behind that is not entirely clear. Furthermore, in order to investigate the ability of applying PPP projects, willingness of the public and private sector with regards to partnership were examined and Critical Success factors (CSFs) were explored and specified.

The opinion of the Jordanian experts was collected via questionnaire. 64 questionnaire were distributed and analyzed using SPSS to find the most important criteria,
another 8 interviews were conducted to collect more specified data and construct proper ANP network, the criteria and sub-criteria were compared using pair wise comparison and in the end Critical Success Factors for PPPs Infrastructure Projects were determined to be as follows; Favorable investment environment, Public/Private/community Engagement and predictable and reasonable legal framework. Accordingly it is recommended to provide a favorable investment to attract interested investors to establish mega projects in Jordan. In addition to that, high level of engagement between the public and the private sector must exist to assure success of PPP projects in Jordan. And last but not least, the researcher believes that proper legal framework shall be established to assure PPP projects success.
TABLE OF CONTENTS

AUTHORIZATION FORM ........................................................................................................ I
COMMITTEE DECISION ..................................................................................................... II
DEDICATION ...................................................................................................................... III
ACKNOWLEDGEMENT ...................................................................................................... IV
ABSTRACT ......................................................................................................................... V
TABLE OF CONTENTS ....................................................................................................... VII
LIST OF TABLES ................................................................................................................ X
LIST OF FIGURES ............................................................................................................. XII

1. Introduction .................................................................................................................. 1
   1.1. Overview of PPP projects ..................................................................................... 1
   1.2. Critical Success Factor Model in Previous PPP Studies ....................................... 2
   1.3. Research Problem ................................................................................................ 3
   1.4. Research Objectives ............................................................................................ 4
   1.5. Research Hypothesis ........................................................................................... 4
   1.6. Research Methodology ......................................................................................... 5
   1.7. Thesis Structure ................................................................................................... 6

2. Literature Review ......................................................................................................... 9
   2.1. Introduction ........................................................................................................... 9
   2.2. Public Private Partnership Models ....................................................................... 9
   2.3. Design-Build-Finance-Operate (DBFO) ............................................................. 11
   2.4. Built Operate Transfer ........................................................................................ 13
   2.5. Build-Own-Operate (BOO) ............................................................................... 14
   2.6. Critical Success Factors ....................................................................................... 15
   2.7. Multi-Criteria Decision Making Models ............................................................ 17
   2.8. ANP Model .......................................................................................................... 19
   2.9. Critical Success Factors for PPPs Infrastructure Projects .................................. 20
       2.9.1. Critical Success Factors for PPPs Infrastructure Projects in United Kingdom .................................................................................................................. 22
       2.9.2. Critical Success Factors for PPPs Infrastructure Projects in China .......... 22
       2.9.3. Critical Success Factors for PPPs Infrastructure Projects in USA .......... 22
Critical Success Factors for Public-Private Partnership “PPP’s” Infrastructure

Projects in Jordan

2.9.4. Critical Success Factors for PPPs Infrastructure Projects in Nigeria ........................................... 23
2.9.5. Analysis of Critical Success Sub-Factors For Public–Private-Partnerships in Nigeria ................................................................. 23
2.9.6. Critical Success factors for PPP projects in South Africa ................................................................. 24

3. Research Methodology ................................................................................................................................. 32
3.1. Introduction .................................................................................................................................................. 32
3.2. Problem Definition ......................................................................................................................................... 35
3.3. Data Collection ............................................................................................................................................... 36
3.4. Primary Data ................................................................................................................................................ 36
3.4.1. Preliminary Selection of Criteria and Sub-Criteria .................................................................................. 37
3.4.2. Computing Relative Importance Index for Constructive Interview Factors ........................................... 38
3.4.3. Z- Value Analysis ....................................................................................................................................... 38
3.5. Secondary Data ............................................................................................................................................. 39
3.5.1. Constructive Interviews for Rating Importance of the Selected Factors ......................................... 40
3.5.2. Analytical Hierarchy/Network Process .................................................................................................. 40
3.5.3. Why Analytical Network Process? ......................................................................................................... 43
3.5.4. Advantage of ANP ..................................................................................................................................... 44
3.5.5. Characteristics of the Decision-Making Approach ................................................................................. 51
3.5.6. ANP Model Construction ......................................................................................................................... 52
3.5.7. The Supermatrix of a Feedback System (Saaty, 2001, 2005) ............................................................... 59
3.5.8. Consistency Ratio Calculation ................................................................................................................. 63
3.5.9. Relative Normalized Weights for Criteria and Sub-Criteria and Alternatives ..................................... 65
3.5.10. Sub-Criteria Global Weights ................................................................................................................... 66
3.5.11. Constructing Network for Critical Success factors of PPP projects in Jordan ...................................... 66
3.5.12. Pair-Wise Criteria and Sub-Criteria Comparison Matrices ................................................................. 66

4. Data Collection and Analysis .......................................................................................................................... 68
4.1. ANP Critical Success Factors Model, Statistical Package for Social Science (SPSS), .............................................. 68
4.2. Utilizing the SPSS to Obtain Criteria and Sub-Criteria .................................................................................. 69
4.2.1. Study Sample .............................................................................................................................................. 69
LIST OF TABLES

Table 2-1: Literature Review for the Critical Success Factors of PPP Projects ............. 26
Table 3-1: Saaty's 1–9 scale for AHP/ANP preference ........................................ 54
Table 3-2: Pair-wise comparison matrix ............................................................... 55
Table 3-3: Saaty's average random consistency index (RI) .................................. 63
Table 4-1: Participants of Questionnaire number 1 ............................................. 69
Table 4-2: Participants Field of Work ................................................................. 70
Table 4-3: Participants Education ................................................................. 70
Table 4-4: Participants Experience ................................................................. 70
Table 4-5: Participants Academic Level ......................................................... 71
Table 4-6: Statistical Description for the Main Criteria .................................... 72
Table 4-7: Statistical Description for the Sub-Criterions of favorable investment environmental ................................................................. 73
Table 4-8: Statistical Description for the Sub-Criterions of Proper Managerial and Technical System ................................................................. 74
Table 4-9: Statistical Description for the Sub-Criterions of Public/Private/community Engagement ................................................................. 75
Table 4-10: Statistical Description for the Sub-Criterions of Social, health and Environmental aspects ................................................................. 76
Table 4-11: Statistical Description for the Sub-Criterions of leadership ................ 77
Table 4-12: Main Criterions Results based on the Mode ................................... 80
Table 4-13: Sub-Criterions for Favorable investment environment Results based on the Mode ................................................................. 81
Table 4-14: Sub-Criterions for Proper Managerial and Technical System Results based on the Mode ................................................................. 82
Table 4-15: Sub-Criterions for Public/Private/community Engagement Results based on the Mode ................................................................. 82
Table 4-16: Sub-Criterions for Social, health and Environmental aspects Results based on the Mode ................................................................. 83
Table 4-17: Sub-Criterions for Leadership Results based on the Mode ................ 83
Table 4-18: Based on personal assessment determine the degree of preference for the main criterions used in critical success factors for PPP projects selection ................. 84
Table 4-19: Based on personal assessment determine the degree of preference for the sub-criteria for the main criterion “Favorable investment environment” .......................... 85
Table 4-20: Based on personal assessment determine the degree of preference for the sub-criteria for the main criterion “Proper Managerial and Technical System” ....................... 86
Table 4-21: Based on personal assessment determine the degree of preference for the sub-criteria for the main criterion “Public/Private/community Engagement” .......................... 87
Table 4-22: Based on personal assessment determine the degree of preference for the sub-criteria for the main criterion “Social, health and Environmental aspects” ...................... 88
Table 4-23: Based on personal assessment determine the degree of preference for the sub-criteria for the main criterion “Leadership” ................................................................. 88
Table 4-24: Analysis of main criteria ........................................................................ 93
Table 4-25: Analysis of Favorable investment Environment (Criteria 1) ...................... 94
Table 4-26: Analysis of Proper Managerial and Technical System (Criteria 2) ............ 94
Table 4-27: Analysis of Public/Private/Community Engagement (Criteria 3) ............... 95
Table 4-28: Analysis of Social, health and environment aspects (Criteria 4) ............... 96
Table 4-29: Analysis of Leadership (Criteria 5) .......................................................... 96
LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 1-1: Research Methodology ................................................................. 5
Figure 1-2: Thesis Structure........................................................................... 6
Figure 3-1: Research Methodology Structure .................................................. 34
Figure 3-2: Structural difference between a hierarchy and a network: (a) a hierarchy; (b) a network ................................................................. 43
Figure 3-3: Advantages of ANP/AHP over other Multi-Criteria Decision-Making Method. ...................................................................................... 46
Figure 3-4: Managerial advantages of Analytic Network Process over Analytic Hierarchy Process ......................................................................... 51
Figure 3-5: Hierarchy and network: (a) hierarchy; (b) network ......................... 59
Figure 3-6: Types of Components in a Network ................................................ 61
Figure 4-1: Critical Success Factors for PPP projects in Jordan’s Network ........ 79
Figure 4-2: Critical Success Factors for PPP projects in Jordan’s “Main Criteria” pairwise comparison ................................................................. 89
Figure 4-3: Favorable Investment environment pairwise comparison ................ 90
Figure 4-4: Proper Managerial and Technical System pairwise comparison ........ 91
Figure 4-5: Public/Private/Community Engagement pairwise comparison .......... 91
Figure 4-6: Social, health and environmental aspects pairwise comparison ......... 92
Figure 4-7: Leadership pairwise comparison ................................................... 92
Figure 4-8: Analysis of main criteria ............................................................... 93
Figure 4-9: Analysis of Favorable investment Environment (Criteria 1) ............. 94
Figure 4-10: Analysis of Proper Managerial and Technical System (Criteria 2) .... 95
Figure 4-11: Analysis of Public/Private/Community Engagement (Criteria 3) ....... 95
Figure 4-12: Analysis of Social, health and environment aspects (Criteria 4) ....... 96
Figure 4-13: Leadership (Criteria 5) ................................................................ 97
Figure 4-14: Criteria and Sub-Criteria Prioritization ......................................... 98